

the selfish temptation to hoard credit for work done by others under their supervision. Blankert's wide-ranging and impeccable archival research offers readers a window into the academy of the nineteenth century, with its high ideals and practical obstacles. And while the book never quite makes good on its titular promise to depict "turbulent times," Blankert does demonstrate through vitriolic private correspondence and targeted popular publications that academic disciplines of the past were full of the same personalities—and the melodrama that personalities so often produce—as the academic disciplines of the present.

Both of these books, then, provide compelling, heavily researched insights into the construction of modern early English studies. The picture they offer of the discipline is refreshingly multifaceted and nuanced, for better and for worse. What is more, they remind us that all historiography, even historiography of historiography, is in some sense a creative discipline rendered meaningful in part by the historiographer.

DAVID G. PEDERSEN, College of the Ozarks

YVES BLOMME, *Quand les cathédrales se mesuraient entre elles: L'incidence des questions hiérarchiques sur l'architecture des cathédrales en France (XIIe–XVe siècles)*. (Scripta mediaevalia 45.) Bordeaux: Ausonius, 2021. Pp. 280; color and black-and-white figures. €18.01. ISBN: 978-2-3561-3438-7. doi:10.1086/736237

*Quand les cathédrales se mesuraient entre elles* surveys cathedral architecture in the nine archdioceses of France between the twelfth and fifteenth centuries. Rather than the usual motors that power histories of Gothic architecture—the intertwined technical and formal developments that transformed the character of religious buildings—Yves Blomme looks to other factors, such as ecclesiastical geography and hierarchy, ecclesiological and devotional change, that produced a building culture driven by competition and emulation. His analytical framework shifts the emphasis from builders to patrons, the cathedral chapter in most projects (22–23), who used architecture as the reflection of their prestige based on manufactured histories of legendary saintly origins. In addition, an intensified worship of the crucified Christ reshaped cathedral space into an environment that presented an abridged history of the world in an image of a universal Christian society (34–36).

The first two chapters set out themes that run through the book: first, the principles of imitation, copying, and citation (15–40); second, the history and definition of ecclesiastical geography. Discussion of the multiple facets of imitation begins with practical conditions in the workshop that increasingly relied on both drawing as a medium of communication and visual memory, then shifts to theological interpretations that evoked biblical models, chiefly the Old Testament descriptions of the Tabernacle and, especially, the Temple of Solomon. John's vision of the Heavenly Jerusalem in Revelation 21, rather than a typological paradigm to be copied, offers a symbolic exemplum materialized in the Gothic. For example, the delicate fretwork of glazed openings, tracery, pinnacles, and arches of the León Cathedral chevet, perched atop the massive city walls, captures the supernatural image invested into the earthly stones of the church by its dedication ceremony. Further, in the wake of the Gregorian reform of the late eleventh century, the period from the twelfth to the fifteenth centuries saw changes in the political landscape as the church sought both to control its possessions and to assert its primacy over the princely realm. As a result, contemporary buildings became sources of inspiration for succeeding projects: the new choir of Canterbury (1174–84), a magnetic martyrium for devotion to saints' relics; and the Sainte-Chapelle in Paris (1239–48), a representation of the sacral claims of the monarchy. Blomme asserts that the "weight of the patron" remained

primordial in orienting cathedrals' design horizons and in the construction of meaning (20). Nevertheless, it is important to keep the collaborative nature of the building enterprise and the active role played by architects in mind. Thus, in 1455, Bleuet, master mason of Reims, who was contacted by the Troyes Cathedral canons for advice on the design of the west façade towers, responded that "it would be good to visit . . . Reims, Amiens, and Notre-Dame of Paris, and he would give his advice based on this" (Stephen Murray, *Building Troyes Cathedral: The Late Gothic Campaigns* [1987], 149).

Chapter 2, "Un peu de géographie ecclésiastique," traces the territorial organization of Gaul from its Roman administrative beginnings into the Christian era as recorded in the *Notitia Galliarum* of the late fourth or early fifth century. By the ninth century, the authority of archbishops had been established over their suffragan bishops, while the *Provinciale Romanae ecclesiae* rewrote diocesan contours in more precise terms by the twelfth century (41–46). Blomme follows its map through the series of ecclesiastical provinces that comprise chapters 3 through 11.

Within this geographical framework, struggles arose around hierarchy both within and between provinces. In the case of Bourges, its primacy over the whole of Aquitaine was resisted by Bordeaux and, within the archdiocese, contested by Clermont. Cathedral chapters remained busy throughout the twelfth and thirteenth centuries authoring illustrious hagiographies of their founder saints to underpin their claims. To cite one example, Austremoine, evangelist to Clermont and Auvergne, was progressively recast from the third-century missionary, mentioned by Gregory of Tours, to a first-century evangelist dispatched by Pope Clement I, to an associate of Peter and witness to the final events of the life of Christ, a biography that outshone that of Bourges's founder, Ursin. In turn, these rivalries resonated through architectural choices and visual iconography: the new choirs at Clermont (186–87) and Bordeaux (203–05) embraced the northern French rayonnant style, perhaps as a conscious challenge to Bourges; their transept façades sported pairs of towers, possibly a reference to a different metropolitan model, Reims; and portal sculpture and stained glass highlighted their saintly bishops.

It must be remembered that the careers of Gothic master masons often took them beyond provincial boundaries: Gautier de Varinfroy worked at Meaux in the archdiocese of Sens and at Évreux, a suffragan of Rouen; Master Bleuet's trip to study façade towers took him through the provinces of Sens and Reims; and Deschamps masons are documented at workshops in the territories of Bourges, Bordeaux, and Narbonne. While mindful of such long-distance movement and the transfer of design ideas and forms, Blomme's focus on regional contexts insists that we pay attention to structures of power and prestige within the institution of the late medieval French church and to the multilevel conversations between patrons and their buildings. In this light, Reims emerges as an inventive *summa* of its suffragans Laon and Soissons, rather than an obedient daughter of Chartres, while Dol looks to Canterbury in unrealized anticipation of its promotion to the rank of metropolitan. At times, architectural analysis speeds by in telegraphic lists, as with the Tréguier cathedral façade linked "à une famille aquitaine et ligérienne, où l'on retrouve les cathédrales du Mans [. . .], de Poitiers [. . .], Angoulême et Bordeaux" [to a family in Aquitaine and the Loire that includes the cathedrals of Mans [. . .], Poitiers [. . .], Angoulême, and Bordeaux] (158, my translation). Readers would be well advised to open their browsers to supplement the book's illustrations.

*Quand les cathédrales se mesuraient entre elles* decenters the landscape of French Gothic architecture, replacing an overarching narrative with a series of microhistories, each animated by its own set of internal dynamics. Pointed arches, rib vaults, flying buttresses, and bar tracery constitute the vocabulary that articulated ecclesiastical hierarchy as Gothic architecture became the medium for the expression of prestige and ambition. By devoting more pages to

Brittany (23) than to the provinces of Sens (19) or Rouen (16), Blomme reminds us that the creative energy of the Gothic was, indeed, widespread throughout the whole of late medieval France.

MICHAEL T. DAVIS, Mount Holyoke College

COURTNEY M. BOOKER, HANS HUMMER, and DANA POLANICHKA, eds., *Visions of Medieval History in North America and Europe: Studies on Cultural Identity and Power*. (Cursor mundi.) Turnhout: Brepols, 2022. Pp. 451; black and white figures. €120. ISBN: 978-2-503-59628-0.

Table of contents available online at <https://www.brepols.net/products/IS-9782503596280-1>. doi:10.1086/736369

Judging by the title, one might expect this volume to compare historiographical approaches to the Middle Ages in North America and Europe and/or reflections on the role of power in shaping identities. While these do all appear, the introduction's stated aim of exploring "identity in its various manifestations throughout medieval Europe" (9) is somewhat more accurate a summary. As other reviewers have noted, though, this is really a volume (unofficially) in honor of Patrick Geary, and when read through that lens, the volume coheres much better.

After an introduction presenting medieval musings on what identity is, there are fifteen essays, grouped into threes by topic: ethnicity, inheritance, religion, law and politics, and textual memory. Jean-Pierre Poly leads off with an evaluation of barbarian identity in the fourth-century Roman military, mainly from onomastics. He concludes that being a Roman citizen and a Christian need not erase one's barbarian identity. Helmut Reimitz then reiterates his earlier work on how early medieval historians understood identity's complexity and importance as a category, ending with an overview of recent scholarship and further directions to historicize medieval ethnicity. Herwig Wolfram closes the ethnicity section by discussing names various people used for Germans in the ninth century.

Turning to inheritance, Edward Schoolman examines ways Ravenna elites expressed heredity and status in ninth- to eleventh-century documents, concluding that "ethnogenic" identity—claimed using the phrase *ex genere*—aided families in exalting their pasts. Sarah Whitten takes us to southern Italy, where charters before the tenth century cite law and legal traditions more often for Lombard women's property transactions than for other cases, suggesting that gender was a key element of Lombard legal identity. Hans Hummer builds on his previous rethinking of kinship by arguing that early medieval inheritance could be determined by blood or spiritual kinship, or both.

The volume then leaps to the later Middle Ages. Carrie Beneš deftly recasts Jacopo da Varagine's late thirteenth-century treatises on Genoese relics as "forms of political rhetoric and community-building" (187). By situating saints in the local landscape, he constructed a civic and religious identity behind which Genoa's citizens could unite. Boris Todorov's essay proposes that fourteenth-century Bulgarian clerics were worried about the threat of Turkish incursions and expressed it through theological discussions of a Christian sense of order and carefully curated collections of texts modeling good crisis management. Returning to the Carolingian period, Dana Polanichka reads into the structure and silences of Dhuoda's manual for her son a degree of ambivalence and disdain toward clergy hitherto unnoticed. Although on the surface Dhuoda praises priests, she subtly undermined their authority over the laity by discussing them after (and far less than) lay nobles and by juxtaposing situations when it was okay to disobey a priest with admonishments never to disobey one's lord.

In the legal and political section, Geoffrey Koziol seeks to redress the balance between descriptive and prescriptive texts for understanding law and order by examining the latter as windows into legal and political imagination. Comparing ninth-century capitularies to